



Town of Yountville

6550 Yount Street
Yountville, CA 94599

Staff Report

Item #: 7A

Zoning and Design Review Board Staff Report

DATE: March 8, 2022

TO: Zoning and Design Review Board Members

FROM: Diane Levine, Assistant Planner

Applicant: Traci Sanderson / Rick Claes

Owner: Traci Sanderson / Rick Claes

Location: 6630 Jefferson Street (APN 036-053-006-000)

Land Use Classification: H, Old Town Historic; C, Creekside Overlay

SUBJECT:

The Applicants are seeking approval for the construction entailing the extensive remodel of an existing 1,234 sq ft 2-story home to 2,500 sq ft with a pool as well as the addition of a new 400 sq ft 2-car garage, 1,192 sq ft accessory dwelling unit (ADU), and a 522 sq ft unenclosed auxiliary structure.

The subject property was previously brought to the Zoning Design and Review Board (ZDRB) on multiple occasions in late 2020 and early 2021. The Applicant has since withdrawn the request for the lot split and developed a new concept plan, describe in summary above and in detail below. As discussed in previous ZDRB meeting, the residence was determined to be a historic resource. In efforts to retain the historical structure, the rehabilitation/expansion will expand upon the original historic structure by respecting its vernacular architecture. Exterior wood shingles have been removed to expose original horizontal wood siding, and where possible, the existing siding will be repaired and retained. Siding in an advanced state of deterioration, beyond repair, will be replaced with siding to match the existing.

COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING ORDINANCE:

Design Standards (YMC Section 17.40.020)			
Design Element	Standard	Proposed	Compliance

<i>1. Garages, Driveways and Parking</i>			
1A.	The width of each garage door shall not exceed 12 feet when located in the front half of the lot and visible from the street.	N/A (garage is not located on the front half of the lot).	N/A
1B.	Multi-car garages are permitted if located on the rear half of the lot or screened from view from adjacent street frontages by building placement, landscaping, and/or fencing in compliance with Chapter 17.136.	Multi-car garage is located on the rear half of the lot.	Yes
1C.	Carports shall be located in the rear half of the lot or screened from view from adjacent street frontages by building placement, landscaping and/or fencing in compliance with Chapter 17.136.	N/A (no carport proposed).	N/A
1D.	For single-family houses with attached garages, the width of the house shall be at least five feet greater than the width of the garage along its street frontage. The garage shall be set back at least 10 feet farther than the house from the street.	N/A (attached garage not proposed).	N/A
1E.	In the Old Town Historic District, driveway aprons shall be a solid surface, concrete, or pavers, for the width of the driveway and the length from the existing edge of asphalt street to the right-of-way line or five feet, whichever is greater.	The apron will be of stone in concrete material.	Yes
<i>2. Street Frontage</i>			
2A.	The principal orientation of all buildings shall be	Main home and garage facing street; ADU does not face street,	Yes

	parallel to streets they face.	although it is located behind the garage and not generally visible from public right-of-way.	
2B.	Primary building entrances and associated paths of travel from the adjacent street(s) shall be visible from the adjacent street(s).	Primary building entrance and driveway would be facing and visible from Jefferson Street. ADU entrance not visible, although it is located behind the garage.	Yes
2C.	Building facades that face street frontages shall include breaks in their wall plane by incorporating one or more techniques along at least 20% of the entire street-facing facade, such as varying setbacks, recessed or projecting building entries, wall offsets, wall projections or variation in materials.	The main residence proposes a street facing façade that includes a covered porch, which creates a recessed entry and architectural projection at two different points on the front of the building.	Yes
2D.	A covered porch shall be incorporated into the front elevation for new construction. The minimum required porch shall be at least 72 square feet in area and shall measure at least six feet deep (measured perpendicular to the front wall of the house). Porches shall be unenclosed but may be screened.	An unenclosed, 6 ft deep, approximately 368 sq ft.	Yes
3. Building Scale and Massing			
3A.	Buildings shall carry the same design in terms of form and massing, roof design, wall and window design, and colors and materials on all building elevations.	All buildings maintain the same design in the forms listed in the requirement, with retention of the front façade in efforts to preserve important architectural features due to its historical value.	Yes
4. Roof Forms			
4A.	The main roof of the	The main roof pitch is 9	Yes

	building shall have a minimum pitch of 4 in 12.	in 12.	
4B.	Roofs which incorporate multiple ridges, eaves and/or dormers are required. Up to 20% of the area of a structure's roof may be flat.	Multiple ridges and eaves are in the 2-story home design as well as a dormer, while still maintain the historically deemed home's 19 th century vernacular farmhouse design elements; the garage and ADU also incorporate multiple eaves and ridges.	Yes
4C.	Roofing shall be composition shingle, standing seam, other fabricated metal, or tile from natural materials. Concrete tile, wood shake, or tar and gravel roofing is prohibited.	Roof materials for all structures are of standing seam metal.	Yes
5. Windows, Doors and Entries			
5A.	Only wood-frame windows, vinyl-clad wood windows or powder-coated metal-framed windows colored by the manufacturer are permitted. Bare metal, plastic, or silver-colored aluminum windows or screen frames are prohibited.	Windows are of aluminum clad wood.	Yes
5B.	Shutters, if incorporated, shall be the same size as half the adjacent window width.	N/A (shutters are not included as part of the design).	N/A
5C.	Trim surrounds shall be provided at all exterior window and door openings. In lieu of exterior window trim, windows can be recessed from wall plane by a minimum of 3 inches.	Window trim or 3" recessed windows will be used.	Yes
6. Exterior Building Materials			
6A.	The following exterior materials are allowed: wood (lap siding, board and batten, shingle),	Exterior materials include wood siding on all buildings with stone and natural rock veneer	Yes

	cement board, or stucco. Natural brick or stone is allowed as an accent material only, covering no more than 25% of any building facade. T-111 or plywood shall not be permitted.	accents. Natural rock veneer on ADU and garage exceeds covering 25% of the building's north wall facade. However, the north wall of the building is not the "front" of the building as seen from the public right-of-way and therefore does not constitute a direct interpretation as the facade. Furthermore, the natural rock veneer provides landscape relief, which reduces the appearance of massing.	
6B.	Design material changes shall occur at intersecting planes, at inside corners of changing wall planes or where architectural elements intersect such as a chimney, pilaster, or projection, except for the base of buildings, corner boards or gable ends.	Design material changes occur at the base and at the pillars on the main structure, where architectural elements intersect on both the exterior of the ADU and visible interior of the auxiliary structure (fireplace).	Yes
7. Landscape and Open Space			
7A.	A minimum of one tree shall be planted within the front yard setback for new development. This standard does not apply to the MHP, Mobile Home District.	N/A (not a new development).	N/A

Design Guidelines YMC Section 17.40.030			
Design Element	Guideline	Proposed	Compliance
8. Driveways, Garages/Carports and Parking			
1A.	Garages are encouraged to be located in the rear half of the lot.	Garage is located in the rear half of the lot.	Yes
1B.	Detached garages and garage doors that do not face the street are	The doors of the detached garage face the street, although not	No

	encouraged.	a focal point from the public right-of-way.	
1C.	Single-car garages may be located near the front of the lot, though this is discouraged.	N/A (No single-car garage in front of lot proposed).	Yes
1D.	On-site paving for vehicles should be of a permeable material, where practical.	The driveway and parking area located in front of the garage will be gravel.	Yes
9. Building Exterior Colors and Materials			
3A.	Buildings shall have consistent materials, details, and architectural theme on all sides of the buildings. Materials that appear faux or veneer-like should be avoided. Joints or raw edges of materials shall be concealed to create an appearance of authenticity.	Shared architectural theme with ADU, garage, and unenclosed auxiliary building. Main building differs because of conformance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, to preserve the historic resource. Although, the incorporation of stone and/or natural stone veneer to all buildings provides additional cohesion.	No
3B.	Auxiliary structures that require issuance of a building permit should have consistent exterior material(s) and color(s) with the primary building.	Colors for main home include gray for siding, white windows and trim, red front door and charcoal gray standing seam metal roof. Auxiliary buildings differ in color with a "silverized" cedar siding and light gray standing seam metal roof.	No
3C.	Mediterranean and Tuscan <i>design</i> styles that include, but are not limited to, the following common characteristics of clay tile, heavy stucco, or plaster, cut and cast stone, wrought iron details, tower-like chimneys, heavy massing, arched openings, and arcades are prohibited.	The design style is that of Victorian/farmhouse vernacular.	Yes

10. Windows, Doors and Entries			
4A.	Double-hung windows should maintain a 1.5:1 height to width ratio or greater.	Double-hung windows of varying sizes are proposed for the main building, all of which maintain a minimum 1.5:1 height to width ratio.	Yes
4B.	Where adjacent to single-family development, windows, balconies, and similar openings should be oriented so as not to have a direct line-of-sight into homes or onto private backyards on abutting properties. This can be accomplished through window placement, stepbacks of upper stories, use of clerestory windows, glass block or opaque glass, or mature landscaping within the rear or side setback areas.	Hopper creek runs along the north portion of the property; there are no windows proposed on the second story of the main building on the south side of the home (side facing adjacent property) and the building is setback approximately 31 feet from the property line. The southside of the ADU has approximately 4-foot setback.	

General Development Standards: H, Old Town Historic (YMC Section 17.28.050)			
Development Standard	Requirement for H District	Proposed	Compliance
Maximum Floor Area Ration (FAR)	<u>Single-family dwellings:</u> Lots <4,000 sq. ft.: Floor area up to 1,000 sq. ft. is permitted. Lots 4,000-10,000 sq. ft.: 0.25 Lots >10,000 sq. ft.: Max. floor area of 2,500 sq. ft. is permitted. <u>Duplexes:</u> 0.40, up to a maximum of 3,200 sq. ft. <u>Multifamily:</u> 0.40, up to a maximum of 4,000 sq. ft.	Lot size is > 10,000 sq ft (15,325). Main Building: 1644 sq ft 1 st story, 856 second story totaling max. floor area of 2,500. ADU: 1,192 sq ft (exempt). Garage: 400 sq ft (exempt). Auxiliary Building: Does not count towards FAR	Yes
Minimum Setbacks			
Front	<u>Primary buildings:</u> 10 feet for buildings up to 15 feet high; 15 feet	25'-4 ½" setback to front porch; 31'-0 ¼" setback to first and	Yes

	<p>for buildings 15-18 feet high; 20 feet for building over 18 feet high.</p> <p>Setback may be reduced to the average front setbacks of existing single-family structures on the same side of the block¹ but shall not be less than 10 feet.²</p> <p><u>Garages:</u> 18 feet</p>	<p>second story.</p> <p>Garage: Approx. 79'.</p>	Yes
Side	<p>5 feet for first story and total of 13 feet for both sides. For lots <50 feet wide, 5 feet each for a total of 10 feet both sides.</p> <p>8 feet for second story and total of 22 feet for both sides. For lots <50 feet wide, 5 feet each for a total of 16 feet both sides.</p>	<p>Lot is approx. 100 ft in width.</p> <p>Southern property boundary side setback main story 31'-7 1/4"; second story 41'-7 3/4" .</p> <p>Northern property boundary side setback main story 16'-3 1/4"; second story 17'-9 1/2" .</p>	Yes
Side (street fronting)	<p>10 feet for first story.</p> <p>16 feet for second story.</p>	N/A (not a corner lot).	N/A
Rear	<p>15 feet for first story.</p> <p>20 feet for second story.</p>	Rear setback for main building is approximately 92 feet.	Yes
Height Limit	<p><u>Single-family dwellings:</u> Two stories maximum, however no more than 50% of parcels containing single-family dwelling units in any block¹ are permitted to exceed one-story in height.</p> <p><u>Duplexes and Multifamily:</u> Two stories maximum.</p> <p>One-story buildings: max. 15 feet to plate and 20 feet to peak.</p> <p>Two-story buildings: max. 20 feet to plate and 28 feet to peak.</p>	N/A (existing home is 2-story).	N/A
Parking	As required by Chapter 17.116 Off-Street Parking and	Two-car garage, providing two covered parking spaces.	Yes

	Loading.	
Auxiliary Structure Minimum Setbacks (YMC17.112)		
<i>Minimum Setbacks (for Unenclosed Auxiliary Building)</i>		
Standard	Proposed	Compliance
Front 20 ft	>80'	Yes
Side 5 ft	North side: Approx. 36'; Southside: Approx. 41'.	Yes
Rear 5 ft	5'	Yes
Height Limits		
An auxiliary structure shall not exceed one story or 10 feet to the plate <i>height</i> or an overall maximum <i>height</i> of 15 feet, except that garages may not exceed an overall maximum <i>height</i> of 20 feet	Unenclosed auxiliary building: 15' Overall height. Garage: 15'-11" Overall height.	Yes
Outdoor fireplaces or ovens shall not exceed a <i>height</i> of 10 feet	Fireplace to not exceed 10' per sheet A3.02 of plans.	Yes

C, Creekside Overlay General Conditions (YMC Section 17.76.020):

A portion of the property is within the C, Creekside Overlay. Therefore, the following general conditions from the Yountville Municipal Code within C, Creekside Overlay have been listed along with the project's compliance with those regulations:

The following general conditions shall be required for all lands designated as C, Creekside Overlay:

A. A setback line on both sides of Hopper Creek which runs parallel and is measured 35 feet from the centerline of the creek and not less than 10 feet from the creek bank shall be referred to as the Hopper Creek setback area.

Compliance: Yes

B. No buildings, wall, fence, or other structure shall be erected, constructed, or placed within the Hopper Creek setback area.

Compliance: Yes

C. It is prohibited to deposit, excavate or remove any material within the Hopper Creek setback area.

Compliance: Included in Conditions of Approval

D. No native vegetation or tree that has a trunk larger than three inches in diameter measured at ground level shall be removed within the Hopper Creek setback area;

Compliance: Included in Conditions of Approval

G. Any structure that now lawfully exists within the Hopper Creek setback area may be continued as an existing legally nonconforming use; provided however, that in the event that the structure is destroyed or demolished, it may be rebuilt only in conformity with the provisions of this chapter.

Compliance: N/A

Landscaping:

The applicant had Prunuske Chatham, Inc prepare initial landscape plans. The plans include a robust list of mostly native plantings that span along the creek setback and front setback, and foundational plantings throughout the “interior” of the lot and along the east property line. Bioretention gardens are indicated on almost the entirety of the south property boundary and within the front setback. The applicant has submitted. In addition to the measures taken in the submitted landscape plans, the applicant will have to submit a complete WELO Guidelines package to the Town prior to the issuance of a building permit pursuant to State of California and Town of Yountville regulations.

Findings and Decision:

17.188.060 Provides that Design Review approval shall be granted when designed and located in a manner that best satisfies the following criteria:

A. The proposed development or physical improvement is appropriate for the site with regard to the siting and scale of buildings, pedestrian and vehicular access and circulation, and relationship of structures and open spaces to the streetscape;

B. The location of structures preserves significant trees, natural features and identified public view corridors;

C. The project will be compatible with neighboring properties and developments with regard to setbacks, building heights, and massing;

D. The project will not be detrimental to neighboring properties and developments with regard to the location of parking facilities, siting of trash enclosures, placement of mechanical equipment, and privacy considerations;

E. The project presents an attractive design, utilizing high-quality building finishes and materials, and design techniques to mitigate potentially bulky building forms, such as modulating varied rooflines, partial upper stories, setbacks for upper story volume and/or a variety of roof forms;

F. Proposed landscaping provides sufficient visual relief, complements the buildings and structures on the site, and provides an inviting environment for the enjoyment of occupants and the public;

G. The existing or proposed infrastructure and utility capacity are adequate for the proposed development; and

H. The proposed project will comply with all applicable provisions of Title 17 and will be consistent with the policies and standards of the General Plan.

On the basis of the above-noted findings and the proposed conditions of approval, staff believes that the design review aspect of the project conforms to the Zoning Ordinance criteria.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorically Exempt per California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guideline 15303; Class 3, New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures.

Per CEQA Guideline 15.064.5 *Determining the Significance of Impacts to Archeological and Historical Resources*

As stated in the California Environmental Quality Act Statute and Guidelines, "Generally, a project that follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings or the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer, shall be considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historical resource."

As analyzed by and detailed in the Architectural Resources Group (ARG) memorandum dated November 16, 2021, it was determined that the residence was determined to be a historic resource under the California Register. As stated above, meeting certain criterion of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation can reduce project related impacts on the environment to a less than significant level. The criterion from the Secretary of the Interior Standards Compliance is included in the ARG memorandum and include analysis of the project as it relates to meeting each standard. As a result of meeting the Standards, the project before you can be considered as mitigated to a level of less than significant impact on the historic resource.

STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL

Is item Identified in Strategic Plan? Yes

If yes, Identify Strategic Goal and Objective. **Quality of Life:** The Town enhances the livability of Yountville by providing well-maintained public facilities, parks, and trails, and quality programs and events.

Briefly Explain Relationship to Strategic Plan Goal and Objective. By participating in design review, the Town ensures new developments comply with municipal code requirements, helping maintain the Town's quality of life.

RECOMMENDATION

Receive staff report and corresponding materials and direct questions to Staff.

Conduct public hearing and receive testimony.

Approve Design Review D-2204 subject to the proposed Conditions of Approval provided by Staff and any additional conditions required by the ZDRB.