



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

ZONING AND DESIGN REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT

Date: June 11, 2024

To: Zoning and Design Review Board Members

From: Irene Borba, Planning & Building Director

Applicant: Yountville Pacific, LLC

Owner: Yountville Pacific, LLC

Architect: Napa Design Partners

Location: 2010 & 2012 Humboldt Street (APN 036-054-022 & 023)

Zoning: Residential-Scaled Commercial (RSC)

Request: Consider and provide direction to staff regarding the Preliminary and Final Master Development Plan, Design Review, and Use Permit for a two-story Mixed-Use (residential and retail) proposal located on the vacant lot on the corner of Humboldt & Jefferson Streets

RECOMMENDATION:

Consider and provide direction to staff regarding the proposed (1) Preliminary and Final Master Development Plan, (2) Design Review, (3) Use Permit, and (4) exemption from the California Environmental Quality Act under CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 as an Infill Development project for the Humboldt & Jefferson Street mixed-use project (the "Project"). Staff seeks direction from the ZDRB on the design of the Project and its consistency with the findings required by the Yountville Municipal Code ("YMC"), as discussed in more detail below. Staff is seeking direction from the ZDRB regarding whether to prepare a resolution recommending conditional approval or disapproval of the Project.

PROJECT SITE

The project site is located at 2010 & 2012 Humboldt Street (corner of Humboldt and Jefferson Streets), two separate parcels (the "Site"). One of the parcels (2010 Humboldt Street) is 0.12 acres (5,037 SF) and the other parcel (2012 Humboldt Street) is 0.14 acres (5,955 SF). A condition of approval to merge the two lots into one prior to issuance of a building permit would be required. Once the parcels are merged, the total lot size will be 0.26 acres or 10,992 SF and therefore, meet the minimum lot size requirements for the zoning district (10,000 SF) (YMC § 17.56.030).

The site is designated by the Yountville General Plan and Zoning Map as Residential-Scaled Commercial (RSC).



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

The Site is currently undeveloped (no structures). The Site contains some existing vegetation (trees & grasses). The Site is located at the corner of Humboldt and Jefferson Streets, with residential uses continuing NW along Jefferson Street and residential uses continuing NE along Humboldt Street. Across the street from Humboldt are commercial uses that move into residential uses. Across the Street from Jefferson Street is Van De Leur Park and directly across the diagonal intersection along Washington Street are commercial uses to the SE.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The project applicant proposes to develop the Site with a two-story mixed-use development comprised of commercial & residential components. The Project will include retail on the bottom floor with storage for retail use on the 2nd floor along with two residential units (2 bedroom and 2 bathrooms units) with private entrance through the parking area for the residential units. The 2nd floor includes a shared outdoor deck and BBQ area with outdoor fireplace. The Project proposal includes on-site parking, tree removal, boundary walls for screening/privacy, exterior lighting, and landscaping (discussed in more detail below).

As permitted per YMC section 17.188.030 (B) the Planning Officer may require the installation of story poles to demonstrate the massing and height of the proposed structure and to understand how the proposed building relates within the context of surrounding structures. Story poles were installed on May 28th.

The building will serve as a flagship location for a locally owned independent retailer. The total square footage is approximately 2,571 SF on the 1st floor and 543 SF for a storage area on the 2nd floor for retail use. The retailer will likely have one to two full-time employees (described in more detail in the Use Permit section of the staff report).

To screen the parking lot, the applicant has proposed a port-cochère along Humboldt Street, which allows vehicle passage into the parking lot, while concealing most of the parking from street view. Additionally, the plan is to create a small outdoor space above the port-cochère to be utilized as an employee break area and for the use of the residential tenants by reservation, through the property manager. This elevated outdoor space will have a BBQ and outdoor fireplace, flowering pots, outdoor furniture, and umbrellas.

An eight-foot wall (precast concrete) will be erected on both the north and east sides of the property to conceal the parking lot and aid in providing privacy to our residential neighbors. The areas adjacent to the walls will be planted with evergreen, flowering vines. The applicant has offered to plant the exterior side of the walls with some flowering vines in accordance with the neighbors' wishes. According to the applicant, all proposed exterior lighting on the Site takes the residential neighbors into account. The Project would be required to comply with the outdoor lighting standards set by YMC Chapter 17.132.

The applicant describes the general design of the building as influenced by modern & Georgian revival blending both a traditional storefront with a residential scaled aesthetic. The building will be finished with a smooth plaster finish in a warm cream with modern black windows and black detailing, including antique cornices along the upper level and large antique doors at the main entrance, to be painted black. There will be overhanging window boxes as well as pots and



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

planters in the outdoor areas. The desired design aesthetic proposes to maintain clean unified lines with traditional architectural forms while maintaining an engaging retail storefront with warmth and charm.

The two proposed residential units will be located on the second floor, each will have a covered and an open private deck and a one car garage. The units will be accessed via the enclosed residential garages and/or open parking area. A total of two units, each with 2 bedrooms, 2 bathrooms, approximately 1,200 square feet each, will include Juliette balconies that overlook Van de Leur Park. The two residential units would be for rent.

The plans as proposed illustrate nine (9) trees to be removed from the Site (refer to plan sheet C-20). The plan does not note the type or size of trees to be removed. Staff notes that there are no heritage trees on the Site per the heritage tree map. The applicant/developer would be required to obtain a tree removal permit prior to removing any protected tree in accordance with YMC Chapter 17.128.

Landscaping (plan sheet L1 of 2) – A landscaping plan was provided and includes a variety of trees (i.e., crape myrtle, pears and walnut trees). The plan shows shrubs (i.e, pittosporum) and other low growing vegetation to be planted to help screen and add to the aesthetics of the Site.

Lighting (plan sheet L2 of 2) shows 12 up lights to be installed in the wells of the trees to be planted. Additionally, approximately 12 gooseneck (down lights) are proposed on the exterior of the building.

Fourteen parking spaces are proposed on-site. Ten parking stalls for the retail space and 4 parking spaces for the residential units.

Trash receptacles for the proposed project are located at the corner of the proposed building on Jefferson Street adjacent to the neighboring driveway of the residential properties.

GENERAL PLAN LAND USE DESIGNATION – RESIDENTIAL-SCALED COMMERCIAL

General Plan – Land Use

The General Plan designation for the Site is Residential-Scaled Commercial. Extensive community input during the General Plan Update process helped identify where revised land use designations and development standards and incentives could create positive changes in the built environment. The Site is one of the parcels identified in the General Plan.

Pursuant to the Land Use Element of the General Plan, due to their proximity to commercial uses on Washington Street, the General Plan changed the designation of these two parcels from Old Town Historic to Residential-Scaled Commercial. The General Plan provided for a program to rezone the two parcels and to require a minimum lot size of 10,000 SF (GP LU-6.2b). The rezoning was completed. A condition of approval would require that prior to issuance of a building permit, the two parcels shall be merged. Once merged, they will exceed the 10,000 SF minimum lot size, for a total lot size of 10,992 SF and therefore meet the requirement of the General Plan.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

The General Plan states that two second-story housing units will be required to ensure there is no loss of housing sites. The design should be oriented toward the corner, with parking behind the building and accessed from Humboldt Street. The General Plan further goes on to state that the residential and commercial uses could share parking spaces. An appropriate buffer to adjoining residential properties would be required to mitigate potential impacts, including light and noise and any building would be required to be of a scale and design that complements the surrounding buildings and utilizes design features to break up the building mass, such as building modules, partial and/or setback upper stories, balconies, awnings, and a variety of roof forms.

Analysis

As proposed, the Project meets the *general* intent of the General Plan for this Site. It is a mixed-use project with retail on the lower floor with two residential units above. Given the Site is a corner lot and given the proposed design, the Project has two public facing facades and access to the existing streets. Per the direction of the General Plan, parking is accessed from Humboldt Street and the parking area is concealed by a port-coche're along Humboldt and is behind the proposed building. An eight-foot wall (precast concrete) will be erected on both the north and east sides of the Site to conceal the parking lot and to aid in providing privacy to the neighboring resident and to mitigate potential noise and light impacts.

The building as designed is a two-story building and is 30' in height at the tallest point (the maximum allowed per the code). The building and massing propose a *uniform* appearance when viewed at the corner of Humboldt and Jefferson Streets *rather than* a multibuilding appearance. The proposed residential units located along the façade facing Washington Street provide Juliette balconies and window box planters to provide *some* relief to enhance the residential scale and character however, additional articulation could be considered to break up the plane, such as setting the 2nd floor back from the 1st floor. Staff has concerns regarding the design of the building, as discussed under both the Master Development Plan and the Design Review sections of the staff report. It should be noted that the Master Development Plan *allows for deviations* to certain aspects of a project proposal (i.e., setbacks, walls/fences, floor area ratio, etc) and certain Design Standards established in YMC section 17.72.030 (applicable to Residential-Scaled Commercial zoning) *may be waived* through the design review process as regulated by YMC Chapter 17.188. The design of the Project is discussed further in the appropriate section of the staff report.

The proposed Project is *generally* consistent with some of the applicable Land Use Goals, Policies, and Actions of the General Plan such as:

LU-5.6 Mixed Use. Encourage mixed use development of residential or office above commercial along the Washington Street commercial corridor.

Goal LU-1: Manage growth and maintain community character.

LU-6.2b Humboldt Rezoning. Rezone two vacant residential parcels at the northeast intersection of Humboldt Street and Jefferson Street from Old Town Historic to Residential-Scaled Commercial with a minimum lot size of 10,000 square feet. Food and wine use incidental to a related retail use, such as a pharmacy soda fountain, may be acceptable as determined by the Town Council. Full-service restaurant, cannabis businesses, tasting rooms, wine bars, and similar



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

uses are not permitted. Require at least two second-story rental housing units in any development proposal. One of the units may be used as a primary dwelling by either the owner or the owner's immediate family subject to a use permit.

LU-6.2 Mix of Uses. Encourage a well-integrated mix of uses that will create an attractive, vibrant, and walkable Washington Street experience.

LU-6.6 Screening for Parking. Screen parking where feasible with buildings, walls, and/or landscape elements.

Staff however raises concerns regarding consistency regarding following General Plan goals and policies which pertain to the design of the building (i.e., mass & bulk) and compatibility with the neighborhood as currently designed, such as:

Goal LU-2: Preserve and enhance the small-town character, scale, and pace of life in Yountville and the Town's connection to its natural surroundings.

LU-2.1 Compatibility of Development. Require that new development, remodels, and additions be of a scale, intensity, and design that integrates with the immediate neighborhood, the town as a whole, and the natural surroundings.

LU-2.2 Variety of Buildings Heights and Sizes. Encourage a variety of building heights and sizes in new development.

LU-2.4 Building Massing. Require use of massing techniques that mitigate heavy or bulky forms (such as modulating building mass, partial upper stories, setbacks for upper story volume, variety of roof forms), building placement that does not obstruct view corridors, and building design that is compatible with adjacent structures to ensure that new buildings do not overwhelm their sites or their neighborhoods.

LU-2.5 Maximum Building Height. Permit two story buildings. All buildings shall adhere to the requirements for massing in Policy LU-2.4.

Staff's concerns are discussed further in the design in the design review section of the staff report.

ZONING - RESIDENTIAL-SCALED COMMERCIAL (RSC) (YMC 17.56)

The Site is zoned Residential-Scaled Commercial (RSC). The land use designation RSC is intended to reinforce Washington Street as the main commercial street in Yountville, and to encourage an appropriate transition to adjacent residential neighborhoods.

Per YMC section 17.56.020 (A), all new uses listed in YMC Section 17.56.030 shall require a use permit (per YMC Chapter 17.200) and new development proposal shall require a Master Development Plan (per YMC Chapter 17.192). Additionally, design review is required (per YMC Chapter 17.188) and all commercial operations shall be subject to YMC Chapter 17.144 (Impact on Adjacent Use).



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

YMC section 17.56.020 (B) states that development shall be of an intensity and scale which preserves and enhances Yountville's small-town character and integrates well with the surrounding neighborhood and natural setting. Commercial uses on the east side of Washington Street should be less intense than those on the west side of the street.

YMC section 17.56.020 (C) states buildings shall be residential in scale, and generally street-oriented with pedestrian entrances from the street. Building height, massing and size shall be compatible with residential development, and comply with the design standards established in YMC Chapter 17.72.

YMC section 17.56.020 (D) states that parking shall be accommodated in ways which limit visibility and prominence, typically in small lots screened from public view (per YMC Chapter 17.116) (Off-Street parking and Loading), and YMC Chapter 17.136 (Walls, Fences and Landscape Screening).

YMC section 17.56.020 (E) states development shall contribute to a well-integrated mix of uses that create an attractive, vibrant, and walkable Washington Street experience.

YMC section 17.56.020 (F) requires development shall maintain an appropriate balance between the needs of residents, visitors, and businesses to assure a livable community for residents.

Site-Specific Conditions (YMC § 17.56.030)

	<i>YMC Requirements</i>	<i>Proposed</i>
<i>Lot size</i>	<i>Min. 10,000SF</i>	<i>10,992 SF when the two lots are merged – if approved, the project would be conditioned to merge the lots</i>
<i>Min. two 2nd story residential rental units as part of any development proposal</i>	<i>Min. two 2nd story residential rental units as part of any development proposal</i>	<i>Two 2nd story residential units proposed.</i>
<i>Mixed Use Development</i>	<i>Requires a Use Permit</i>	<i>Use Permit request submitted.</i>

General Development Standards (YMC § 17.56.060)

Development Standard	YMC Requirement	Proposed
Max Floor Area Ratio (FAR) FAR -Calculation defined as: The floor area of a development shall be calculated using the sum of the gross areas of the enclosed floors of a building or buildings measured from the centerline of the exterior wall or bottom plate or from the centerline of party walls	0.25 <i>Additional 0.15 FAR bonus for housing uses & professional office use (17.178)</i> <i>There shall be only one additional FAR bonus of 0.15 and it may include a combination of uses listed.</i>	0.53 <i>Does not comply. A deviation through the MDP would be required.</i>



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

separating such buildings. Interior portions of buildings with a minimum of 100 square feet of open area and 16 feet or more of clear open area from the floor to the ceiling shall be regarded as an assumed second floor that shall be included as floor area for the purpose of calculating FAR.		
Min. Setbacks		
Front	15'	10' (Humboldt) <i>Does not comply. A deviation through the MDP would be required.</i>
Sides	Determined by MDP	10' (side – Jefferson Street) 6' – 3 ¼"
Rear	Determined by MDP	5'
Height Vertical distance measured from the average level of the highest and lowest point of that portion of the lot covered by the building to the highest point of the roof, ridge, or parapet wall of the building.	Two stories maximum Max – 22' to plate and 30 feet to peak	30' to top
Top Story Floor Area Limit No more than 40% of the floor area of any building may be on the top floor. Note - (if the total area of the building is 5,700SF then the 2 nd floor cannot exceed 40% or 2,280SF)	40% (2,280SF)	3,202 SF <i>Does not comply. A deviation through the MDP would be required.</i>
Minimum Open Space Open Space - means any front, side and rear yards or setbacks, courts, landscaping, usable open space, are not covered by buildings, parking or refuse service area provided to meet the requirements of title 17.	Lots 10,000 – 20,000 SF – 15% of gross area 15% of 10,992 SF = 1,648 SF	Shared Open Space: 773 SF (uncovered deck) Unit A (Private Open Space: 208 SF Unit B Private Open Space: 208 SF 1 st Floor Open Space: 3,974 SF



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

<p>Parking (17.116) Retail - 1 space per 250 SF Residential – 4 spaces (one covered and one screened)</p>	<p>As required by Chapter 17.116, Off-Street Parking and Loading</p> <p>Retail/Commercial: one space per 250 SF of use</p> <p>Residential Uses: (Duplex): Four spaces – consisting of one covered and one screened for each unit</p>	<p>Total of 14 parking spaces provided including 2 – EV spaces</p> <p><i>Does not comply. A deviation through the MDP would be required.</i></p> <p>(Note – 3,114 SF of retail (2,571 + 543) requires 12 parking spaces + the 4 for the residential units = 16 spaces required)</p> <p><i>(Note: It doesn't appear that applicant calculated the retail storage space in the parking requirements).</i></p>
<p>Bicycle Parking (17.116.020 I) Bicycle storage space shall be provided in all parking areas of 10 or more spaces.</p>	<p>Retail = min of 5% of the required vehicles spaces.</p> <p>Residential (multi-family) – min. of 10% of the required vehicle spaces.</p>	<p>2 racks provided which hold two bikes each = 4 bike spaces provided.</p>
<p>Signage</p>		<p>None proposed – Condition for Sign Permit if project approved.</p>

MASTER DEVELOPMENT PLAN (YMC 17.192)

A Master Development Plan is required for all new or expanded commercial development or for any subdivision or development of five or more parcels or residential dwelling units. The project requires a Preliminary and Final Master Development Plan.

Pursuant to YMC 17.192.030 D, *deviations* may be approved as part of a preliminary or final Master Development Plan to diverge from the following standards:

- minimum yards and setbacks;
- maximum heights of buildings,
- walls and fences; minimum and
- maximum lot size;
- maximum floor area ratio;
- minimum number of parking spaces, location, and design;
- design standards related to the relation of buildings to streets; minimum open space; and signage.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

The project would require deviations from the standards for setbacks, FAR, including top story floor area requirement, and parking.

To approve a Preliminary and Final Master Plan, the Board and or Council must make required findings (YMC 17.192.060):

- (A) The proposed development, and each increment of a phased project, creates an environment of sustained desirability and stability.
- (B) The land uses and design of the proposed development are consistent with the intent of the General Plan, Title 17, and any other applicable plans or policies adopted by the Town Council, or those in the process of being prepared and adopted, and
- (C) Findings can be made as required by Sections 17.188.060 (Design Review Findings) and 17.200.060 (Use Permit Findings) of the YMC.

Staff notes the Project is generally consistent with some of the General Plan goals, policies, etc., however staff has concerns regarding the mass and bulk of the proposed structure and its relationship to the neighboring properties, specifically the adjacent residential units, and therefore staff is unable to make required findings B and C.

USE PERMIT (YMC 17.200)

Pursuant to YMC 17.200.060, the responsible reviewing authority may approve the application and authorize a use permit if from all the facts presented all the following findings can be made:

- A. The proposed *use*, at the intensity represented and at the proposed location, will provide a use that is compatible with the neighborhood and community.
- B. The proposed *use* will not be detrimental to the health, safety, convenience or general welfare of persons residing or working in the vicinity, or injurious to property, improvements or potential development in the vicinity.
- C. The proposed *use* would not conflict with the Town's goal of achieving economic sustainability with a mix of varied commercial services.
- D. The proposed *use* will not impair accessibility or traffic patterns for persons and vehicles based on the type and volume of anticipated traffic, will provide safe and adequate ingress and egress, and will furnish adequate off-street parking and loading for both customers and employees to the extent deemed feasible by the decision-making body.
- E. The proposed *use* provides sufficient safeguards to prevent noxious or offensive emissions such as glare, dust and odors, or levels of noise which may exceed the Town's noise regulations.
- F. The proposed *use* does not require excessive amounts of water or generate excessive amounts of waste.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

-
- G. The existing or proposed utility, police and fire services are adequate to serve the proposed *use*.
 - H. The proposed *use* will comply with all applicable provisions of Title 17 and will be consistent with the policies and standards of the General Plan.

The proposed mixed-use development of retail and residential (2 apartment units) is proposed at an intensity that is compatible with the neighborhood and the community. The proposed use (retail and residential) will not be detrimental to the health, safety, convenience, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the vicinity, or injurious to property, improvements, or potential development in the vicinity and complies with the General Plan. The proposed use would not conflict with the Town's goal of achieving economic sustainability with a mix of varied commercial services; the proposal provides for mixed-use including retail uses and residential.

The use will not impair accessibility or traffic patterns for persons and vehicles based on the type and volume of anticipated traffic, and the Project as designed will provide safe and adequate ingress and egress. A traffic analysis was conducted and states that impacts to traffic would be less than significant (refer to environmental section of the staff report and Attachment E).

The proposed use provides sufficient safeguards to prevent noxious or offensive emissions such as glare, dust and odors, or levels of noise which may exceed the Town's noise regulations. Noise, dust, and odors during construction will be conditioned accordingly to comply with the Town's and or other requirements. Additionally, the proposed uses, retail and residential, will be required to operate within the proposed hours of operation per the use permit and required to comply with the Town's noise ordinance.

The proposed mixed-use Project does not require excessive amounts of water nor would generate excessive amounts of waste.

The existing or proposed utility, police and fire services are adequate to serve the proposed use; the subject parcel is an in-fill development surrounded by other commercial and/or residential uses.

Staff believes the findings required by § 17.200.060 to approve the Use Permit can be made and the *use* meets the intent of what was envisioned by the Town's General Plan.

DESIGN REVIEW (YMC 17.188)

The reviewing authority may approve the application for design review if the facts presented establish all the following findings:

- A. The proposed development or physical improvement is appropriate for the site with regard to the siting and scale of buildings, pedestrian and vehicular access and circulation, and relationship of structures and open spaces to the streetscape;



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

-
- B. The location of structures preserves significant trees, natural features and identified public view corridors;
 - C. The project will be compatible with neighboring properties and developments with regard to setbacks, building heights, and massing;
 - D. The project will not be detrimental to neighboring properties and developments with regard to the location of parking facilities, siting of trash enclosures, placement of mechanical equipment, and privacy considerations;
 - E. The project presents an attractive design, utilizing high-quality building finishes and materials, and design techniques to mitigate potentially bulky building forms, such as modulating varied rooflines, partial upper stories, setbacks for upper story volume and/or a variety of roof forms;
 - F. Proposed landscaping provides sufficient visual relief, complements the buildings and structures on the site, and provides an inviting environment for the enjoyment of occupants and the public;
 - G. The existing or proposed infrastructure and utility capacity are adequate for the proposed development; and
 - H. The proposed project will comply with all applicable provisions of this Title 17 and will be consistent with the policies and standards of the General Plan.

Analysis

As proposed, staff are unable to make all of the above noted findings for design review. Staff raise concerns regarding the mass and bulk of the proposed structure. The building is 30' in height at the tallest point and although 30' in height is permitted per the code, staff questions the height and the relationship to the neighboring properties, specifically the neighboring residential properties. The two-story structure has some articulation and details to provide some interest to the building, but staff are uncertain that there is sufficient articulation and interest in the building as designed. Additionally, the 2nd story of the proposed structure is not setback from the first story, therefore it creates a large plane along the street frontage. The Board may want to discuss breaking up the front facing facades along the street. Also, by setting back the 2nd story, it therefore reduces the size of the 2nd floor and may reduce the mass and bulk of the structure.

NONRESIDENTIAL & MIXED-USE DESIGN STANDARDS (YMC 17.72)

The following nonresidential and mixed-use design standards apply to new or modified non-residential and mixed-use structures and auxiliary structures. The nonresidential and mixed-use design standards are subjective design criteria which are mandatory for commercial projects unless waived through design review approval to allow alternative design approaches deemed appropriate for the unique conditions of the subject site and its surroundings.

17.72.020 District design intent. The following description defines the design intent for new non-residential structures in the applicable zoning district.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

-
- A. Residential-Scaled Commercial buildings are intended to provide an appropriate transition between commercial and residential areas. Typically, these buildings are similar in size to single-family houses and other residential buildings. The design standards outlined below intend to encourage the development of multiple, small, pedestrian-oriented buildings that combine to form publicly accessible courtyards and passageways, with parking at the rear of the Site.

17.72.030 Design Standards. The following are design standards (applicable to Residential-Scaled Commercial zoning) which all nonresidential projects are required to conform with, *unless waived* by design review approval as regulated by Chapter 17.188 of this title.

A. Building Scale and Massing.

1. Use massing techniques that mitigate heavy or bulky forms, such as modulating building mass, partial upper stories, setbacks for upper story volume, and varying roof forms.
2. Break up the massing of buildings and the scale of long façades to fit the rhythm of the surrounding block.
3. Avoid placement of structures or dense landscaping which obstructs public view corridors as defined in the General Plan
4. In the Residential-Scaled Commercial District, proposed development should consist of multiple small buildings rather than one large building. If total proposed building square footage exceeds 5,000 square feet, consideration and preference shall be given to multiple buildings. Building size and location should consider existing trees or similar site conditions which are considered important to the Town's character.
7. Blank walls (facades without doors or windows) shall be less than 30 feet in length if visible from adjacent street(s).

B. Street Frontage.

1. Buildings should be pedestrian oriented, creating an attractive and active sidewalk and street frontage.
2. Create or reinforce a well-defined rhythm of intervals of built and open spaces. Pedestrian passageways between buildings should generally be at least 12 feet in width.
3. Where possible, provide open spaces adjacent to the sidewalk and design public frontages to support direct engagement with the street to encourage pedestrian activity and informal community gathering.
4. Support adjacent sidewalks and public spaces with active ground floor uses and amenities such as seating and public art.
5. Create a human-scale environment at street level with architectural detailing that adds variety and rhythm to the facade.
6. Give prominence to pedestrian entrances over vehicle access.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

-
7. Create focal points and integrated public spaces at prominent corner sites.
 8. Ground floor façades shall be articulated, with a variety of measures to create a streetscape of interest, such as indentations in plane, change of materials in a complementary manner, façade modulation, and façade elements like transparency, building entries and other architectural details that engage the pedestrian.

C. Exterior Building Materials & Colors.

1. Buildings shall have consistent materials, details, and architectural theme on all sides of the buildings. Materials that appear faux or veneer-like should be avoided, and joints, or raw edges of materials shall be concealed to create an appearance of authenticity.

D. Parking & Driveways

1. Locate at-grade parking and vehicular access away from active pedestrian areas wherever possible and screen at-grade parking from public view. Limit the amount of Washington Street frontage that can be used for parking or vehicular access.
2. In larger developments, parking should be provided in smaller lots, rather than one large lot.
3. Provide bicycle parking near access points and active areas to maximize visibility and convenience.
4. Consider measures that maximize the amount of onsite and offsite parking, including valet, tandem, parking structures and other creative solutions provided they take into account neighborhood context, view corridors, setbacks, screening and massing.
5. Access drives to off-street parking shall be designed and constructed to provide adequate safety for pedestrians and drivers. In no case shall car movements result in blocking of the street right-of-way. The number of access drives shall be limited to the minimum that will accommodate anticipated traffic.
6. To minimize the amount of paved area, the sharing of driveways and access to parking lots is encouraged. An easement providing for shared use shall be recorded.
7. Where practical, on-site paving for vehicles should be of a permeable material.
8. Lighting for parking areas shall be designed to confine emitted light to the parking areas, and the light source shall not be visible from adjacent properties. Average illumination at the ground shall be no more than one foot candle, except where an increase in lighting level is recommended by a lighting consultant or qualified professional as necessary for safety.

E. Open Space.

1. Use landscape design to connect a network of open spaces appropriate to the project context. This open space network could include the streetscape and building frontages, spaces between buildings, or a series of planted areas and hardscape intended for outdoor use and pedestrian circulation.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

-
2. Encourage interaction between the building's interior uses and exterior public space, including plazas, seating areas and other hardscape areas to support public activities appropriate to the site context and building use.
 3. Choose plantings that complement the proportions and scale of the building, offer color and interest throughout the year, and are water efficient.
 4. Locate deciduous trees to complement passive solar strategies, providing shade in summer and allowing sun in the winter.
 5. Use public art as required by Chapter 17.148 of this title to enhance buildings and publicly accessible spaces.

F. Utilities & Auxiliary Structures.

1. Locate utility areas away from public areas and adjacent sensitive uses.
2. Integrate utilities and service functions into the architectural design. Screen rooftop equipment from view and group roof penetrations to the extent feasible.
3. Utilities and refuse storage areas are not permitted in any setback area or front yard.
4. All new electrical, telephone, CATV and similar service wires or cables shall be installed underground. Risers on poles or buildings are permitted.
5. Electrical vaults and meter boxes must be screened from view and discreetly located. Fire pipes and extinguishers must be easily identified, but discreetly located.
6. Refuse storage areas shall be screened from public and adjacent properties view or located within a building. All refuse storage areas shall be maintained to minimize odor and other impacts.
7. Trash and recycling areas shall be fully enclosed structures with solid roofs and shall conform with all mandated water quality requirements and building codes, including accessibility requirements for persons with disabilities. Chain link fencing and gates with wood or plastic slats shall not be used for trash and other utility enclosures.
8. All exterior mechanical and electrical equipment shall be screened by landscaping or fencing or incorporated into the design of buildings so as not to be visible from the street. Equipment to be screened includes, but is not limited to, all roof-mounted equipment, air conditioners, heaters, cable equipment, telephone entry boxes, irrigation control valves, electrical transformers, pull boxes, and all ducting for air conditioning, heating, and blower systems.
9. Reduced pressure backflow prevention devices are required for connection to the Town's water system, and are required to be above ground, but shall be screened from adjacent public street(s) by landscaping or fencing while allowing access for annual testing.

Analysis

Similar to the design review findings, staff are unable to make each of the Mixed-use Design Standards as the Project as proposed appears to be not meet the mass and bulk design standards



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

of the Code. As noted above, the proposed structure is two stories in height at the maximum height requirement of 30' at some points, the 2nd story is not set back from the street frontage therefore creating a tall building along the street. Additionally, setting the 2nd story back from the 1st story would not only provide some relief but would reduce the amount of floor area on the 2nd floor, and therefore reduce the mass and bulk. The proposed structure is requesting several deviations from the master development plan including parking, floor area, and top story requirements and the setback on Humboldt street.

REGULATIONS FOR IMPACT ON ADJACENT USES (YMC 17.144)

Because the project is located in the RSC Zone adjacent to existing or planned residential areas, it must comply with the following "Impact Category I" standards (YMC § 17.144.020):

1. Noise.

a. Impact category I. All noise generating operations shall be buffered so that they do not exceed noise levels identified in chapter 8.04 of this code.

The Project would be conditioned to comply with the noise requirements of the Municipal Code for construction of the Project and after the Project has been built.

2. Light impact.

a. Impact category I. No bright or flashing light shall be visible in a residential district a lighted sign shall be subject to section 17.132.090 and end chapter 17.152, Signs, of this Title.

The lighting as proposed appears to meet the requirements of the Code and are down lights, however a condition of approval would require that plans submitted for building permit be reviewed to ensure consistency with the lighting requirements of the Municipal Code.

3. Traffic circulation and parking.

a. Impact category I. New development must demonstrate that it will not substantially increase truck traffic on residential streets. Trucks over 210 shall not be permitted on local residential streets customer and employee parking and truck loading area shall be provided in accordance with chapter 17.116, off street parking and loading of this title.

A traffic Impact Assessment dated April 5, 2024, was prepared by AMS Associates for the proposed Project. The analysis concluded that no significant impacts on traffic flow and operations were anticipated. The parking currently proposed does not satisfy Chapter 17.116 and would require the granting of a deviation through approval of the MDP.

4. Vibration.

a. Impact Category I. No perceptible vibrations shall be permitted off the development site.

Vibrations should only potentially occur during construction, the potential impacts would be temporary.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

5. Flammable material.

- a. Impact category I. No operations involving the use or storage flammable materials or fuses shall be permitted adjacent to any residential area.

The proposed use is a mixed use Project that includes retail and residential, there will be no flammable materials for the operations of the proposed uses.

6. Airborne emissions.

- a. Impact category one. No use shall exceed the maximum permissible emission standards established by the San Francisco Bay Area Air Quality Management District.

The Project site is located in the San Francisco Bay Area Air Basin (SF Air Basin). The air quality of the SF Air Basin is a product of sources of air pollution within the basin, transport of pollutants to and from surrounding areas, local and regional meteorological conditions, and the surrounding topography. The local air quality regulatory agency responsible for the SF Air Basin is the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD).

The Bay Area Air Basin is designated as non-attainment for both the one-hour and eight-hour state ozone standards, 0.09 parts per million (ppm) and 0.07 ppm, respectively. The Bay Area Air Basin is also in non-attainment for PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5} state standards, which require an annual arithmetic mean (AAM) of less than 20 µg/m³ for PM₁₀ and less than 12 µg/m³ for PM_{2.5}. In addition, the Basin is designated as non-attainment for the national 24-hour fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}). All other national ambient air quality standards within the Bay Area Air Basin are attained. Implementation of the BAAQMD Best Management Practices for Construction-related fugitive dust is imposed as a condition of approval of the Master Development Plan. As such the Project will not have a significant effect from fugitive dust emissions.

7. Water Quality.

- a. Impact Category I. The town shall evaluate liquid waste to be disposed into its sewer system and report upon the town's capacity to provide treatment industries not connecting to the municipal sewer system are subject to water quality standards administered by the San Francisco Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board.

The proposed Project will be required to connect to the Town's municipal sewer and water systems and comply with the regulations applicable thereto.

8. BUILDING SIZE & ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN.

- a. Impact Category I. All building design inside layouts shall be approved by the Zoning and Design Review Board or Town Council.

The Project application includes design review which will be reviewed and considered by the ZDRB and the Town Council.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

COMMERCIAL & MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT INCENTIVES (17.178)

The Town Council may grant certain development incentives for specified commercial or mixed-use developments. However, floor area ratio (FAR) bonuses shall not exceed a maximum of 0.15 (YMC § 17.178.050).

Even with the FAR bonus allowed per the YMC, the Project exceeds allowable FAR. The RSC Zone allows 0.25. With the 0.15 additional FAR bonus for mixed-use, this would increase to .40. However, the Project proposal is at 0.53.

To exceed this FAR standard, the Town Council would need to grant a deviation through approval of the Master Development Plan (YMC 17.192.030(D)).

NEIGHBOR COMMENTS

Staff has received concerns from some the neighboring property owners. Some of the concerns raised pertain to the size and height of the proposed structure, the location of the trash receptacles, impacts to neighboring trees, intrusion of the residents in the proposed two-story structure looking down on the adjacent properties (refer to attachments).

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The Project is eligible for an exemption from the California Environmental Quality Act under CEQA Guidelines §15332 Infill Development Projects, which applies when:

- A. The project is consistent with the applicable general plan designation and all applicable general plan policies as well as with applicable zoning designation and regulations.
- B. The proposed development occurs within city limits on a project site of no more than five acres substantially surrounded by urban uses.
- C. The project site has no value, as habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species.
- D. Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality.
- E. The site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

The Site is less than five acres and is substantially surrounded by existing development. The Site is currently undeveloped and is served by existing utilities and public services. The Mixed-Use development would add a mix of uses including retail and two new apartments, consistent with the General Plan designation and Zoning district. The Town's General Plan envisioned a two-story mixed-use development for the subject property.

The subject property is surrounding by existing development and has no value as sensitive habitat or to support rare or endangered species and approval of the Project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality.

Traffic - The California Governor's Office of Planning & Research (OPR) in the publication *Transportation Impacts (SB 743)* CEQA Guidelines Update and Technical Advisory, 2018 contains several criteria to identify certain types of projects that are unlikely to have a Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) impact and can be "screened" from further VMT analysis including small projects that generate fewer than 110 vehicle trips per day. A traffic Impact Assessment dated



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

April 5, 2024, was prepared by AMS associates for the proposed Project (Attachment E). The analysis concluded that no significant impacts on traffic flow and operations were anticipated. The analysis did note that because of the access driveway onto the site up to two on-street parking spaces would be eliminated. The Project would result in a net increase of approximately ninety-four (94) vehicle trips per day which falls below the “small project” screening criteria as provided by the Office of Planning Research. Therefore, the Project is below the screening level, would not result in a significant effect relating to traffic, and meets this criterion for a Class 32 exemption.

Noise - The construction phases of the Project would generate maximum noise however these activities would be temporary in nature and anticipated to occur during normal daytime working hours. Noise would also be generated by increased truck traffic, which would also be of short duration and occur during daytime hours. The Town’s General Plan requires implementation of Best Management Practices which are a standard condition of approval of the Master Development Permit. Implementation of Best Management Practices will ensure that temporary construction noise will not have a significant effect. The Project design elements include the use of Best Management Practices and the use of static drum rollers instead of vibrations for soil compaction. Implementation of Best Management Practices are a condition of approval of the Master Development Plan and as designed and conditioned, the Project will not have a significant effect on vibration. The operation of the Project would include typical commercial and residential noise which is consistent and compatible with existing adjacent & residential uses. As analyzed and with uniformly applied development standards imposed as project conditions of approvals, the Project will not have a significant effect on noise. Therefore, the Project would not result in a significant effect relating to noise and the Project meets this criterion for a Class 32 exemption.

Air Quality - The Project site is in the San Francisco Bay Area Air Basin (SF Air Basin). The air quality of the SF Air Basin is a product of sources of air pollution within the basin, transport of pollutants to and from surrounding areas, local and regional meteorological conditions, and the surrounding topography. The local air quality regulatory agency responsible for the SF Air Basin is the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD).

The Bay Area Air Basin is designated as non-attainment for both the one-hour and eight-hour state ozone standards, 0.09 parts per million (ppm) and 0.07 ppm, respectively. The Bay Area Air Basin is also in non-attainment for PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5} state standards, which require an annual arithmetic mean (AAM) of less than 20 µg/m³ for PM₁₀ and less than 12 µg/m³ for PM_{2.5}. In addition, the Basin is designated as non-attainment for the national 24-hour fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}). All other national ambient air quality standards within the Bay Area Air Basin are attained. Implementation of the BAAQMD Best Management Practices for Construction-related fugitive dust is imposed as a condition of approval of the Master Development Plan. As such the Project will not have a significant effect from fugitive dust emissions.

Fugitive Dust

Pursuant to General Plan OS-7.1d, the Project will implement BAAQMD Best Management Practices for Construction-related fugitive dust. These practices include:

- All exposed surfaces (e.g., parking areas, staging areas, soil piles, graded areas, and unpaved areas)
- access roads) shall be watered two times per day.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

-
- All haul trucks transporting soil, sand, or other loose material off-site shall be covered.
 - All visible mud or dirt tracked out onto adjacent public roads shall be removed using wet power vacuum street sweepers at least once per day. The use of dry power sweeping is prohibited.
 - All vehicle speeds on unpaved roads shall be limited to 15 mph.
 - All roadways, driveways, and sidewalks to be paved shall be completed as soon as possible.
 - Building pads shall be laid as soon as possible after grading unless seeding or soil binders are used.
 - All excavation, grading, and/or demolition activities shall be suspended when average wind speeds exceed 20 mph.
 - All trucks and equipment, including their tires, shall be washed off prior to leaving the site.
 - Unpaved roads providing access to sites located 100 feet or further from a paved road shall be treated with a 6- to 12-inch layer of compacted layer of wood chips, mulch, or gravel.
 - Publicly visible signs shall be posted with the telephone number and name of the person to contact at the lead agency regarding dust complaints. This person shall respond and take corrective action within 48 hours. The Air District's General Air Pollution Complaints number shall also be visible to ensure compliance with applicable regulations.

Implementation of the BAAQMD Best Management Practices for Construction-related fugitive dust would be imposed as a condition of approval of the Master Development Plan. As such the Project will not have a significant effect from fugitive dust emissions.

Toxic Air Contaminants and Health Risk

Project-related toxic air contaminants (TACs) typically include diesel particulate matter (DPM), lead, and benzene, and the associated risks to the local community. Common sources of TACs include freeways, ports, railyards, industrial facilities, gas stations, and backup diesel generators.

At the Project-level, construction activities would result in short term emissions that could potentially impact nearby sensitive receptors including surrounding residential uses. During construction, onsite activities will result in airborne particles from site disturbance and construction equipment emissions (i.e., diesel particulate matter exhaust emissions from vehicles and heavy equipment operations). Health risks from diesel-exhaust emissions are connected to long-term exposure and the associated carcinogenic risk. For toxic air contaminants (TACs) and effects on sensitive groups, health risks are based on a 30-year exposure period in accordance with the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment. A condition of approval of the Master Plan requires implementation of the BAAQMD Best Practices for construction related exhaust emissions.

Odors

The Project is a mixed-use infill development (retail and residential – two apartments) within an area already developed. No land uses are proposed that would have the potential to result in other emissions, including odors, that would adversely affect the surrounding community.

Greenhouse Gas Emissions

The Project will utilize BMPs to minimize the emissions of greenhouse gases, including the use the installation of electric vehicle charging stations to minimize the use of gasoline. The Project is consistent with all the applicable Town of Yountville's Climate Action Plan policies which is below



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

the threshold set by the BAAQMD CEQA Guidelines (2022). Therefore, the Project would not have a significant effect on Greenhouse Gas Emissions.

As designed and conditioned through Project approvals, the Project will not have a significant effect on air quality, health risk, or greenhouse gases and meets this criterion for an exemption under Class 32 of the CEQA Guidelines.

Water Quality - The proposed Project includes a stormwater control plan prepared by AMS Associates (plan sheet SW-1). Pursuant to YMC Chapter 13.128 Control of Urban Runoff, Public Works conditions require final approval of stormwater management and treatment, erosion control, and implementation of the hydrology plan.

Through the implementation of uniform standards and as conditioned, the Project will not have a significant effect on water quality and this criterion is satisfied qualifying the Project for a Class 32 exemption.

Review for Exceptions to CEQA Exemption

If a project qualifies for use of a categorical exemption, then the lead agency must determine whether the project is subject to any of the exceptions that would preclude the use of a categorical exemption, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2:

(a) Location. Certain classes of projects (Classes 3, 4, 5, 6, and 11) are qualified by consideration of where the project is to be located and whether it may impact an environmental resource of hazardous or critical concern.

Section 15300.2(a) does not apply to the Class 32 exemption; therefore, this exception does not apply.

(b) Cumulative Impact. All exemptions are inapplicable when the cumulative impact of successive projects of the same type in the same place, over time is significant.

The proposed Project will develop the site in its entirety and will not result in successive projects of the same type or in the same place over time. Therefore, this exception does not apply.

(c) Significant Effect. A categorical exemption shall not be used for an activity where there is a reasonable possibility that the activity will have a significant effect on the environment due to unusual circumstances.

The proposed Project Site is located within the Town limits of Yountville. The proposed Project is a mixed-use development (retail & residential – two apartments). There are no known site conditions or elements of the proposed Project that would have a significant effect on the environment due to unusual circumstances. As such, this exception does not apply.

(d) Scenic Highways. A categorical exemption shall not be used for a project which may result in damage to scenic resources within a highway officially designated as a state scenic highway.



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

The Project site is not located on, adjacent to, or in a location visible from a highway officially designated as a state scenic highway. Therefore, this exception does not apply.

(e) *Hazardous Waste Sites. A categorical exemption shall not be used for a project located on a site which is included on any list compiled pursuant to Section 65962.5 of the Government Code.*

A search of GeoTracker indicates that there are no known LUST clean-up sites within the vicinity of the proposed project or onsite.¹ Additionally, there are no Federal Superfund, State Response, Voluntary Cleanup, or School Cleanup sites within the vicinity of the Project or onsite. Therefore, the Project is not on a site which is included on any list compiled pursuant to Section 65962.5 of the Government Code and this exception does not apply.

(f) *Historical Resources. A categorical exemption shall not be used for a project which may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource.*

Not applicable as there are no historic resources on the Site.

CEQA Summary

As provided above, the Project qualifies for an exemption under CEQA Guidelines Section 15332, because it meets all the criterion and none of the exceptions to a categorical exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2 apply. Therefore, the Project is categorically exempt from CEQA.

STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL

By participating in a development review, the Town ensures new developments comply with Municipal Code requirements, helping maintain the Town's quality of life.

SUMMARY

As noted above, staff believe the project meets the *general intent* of what was envisioned by the General Plan for this property, a two-story mixed-use project that would include a mix of uses (retail & two residential units). Staff has no issues or concerns with the proposed Use Permit request. **Staff, however, have concerns with the design as proposed, specifically related to mass and bulk as discussed in the staff report and as summarized here.**

The building as designed is a two-story building and is 30' in height at the tallest point (the maximum allowed by the Code). The board/applicant may want to consider if the height of the building could/should be reduced. The building and massing propose a uniform appearance when viewed at the corner of Humboldt and Jefferson Streets rather than a multibuilding appearance as suggested by the Code. Although the proposed residential units on the 2nd floor as designed provide Juliette balconies and window planter boxes which provide some relief and enhance the design along the street frontage, staff wonders whether it's sufficient or if additional articulation can be provided to reduce the mass and bulk from the street frontage. Staff suggests that the 2nd story be setback from the 1st story to help reduce the mass and bulk from the street frontage. By setting back the 2nd story, it would also reduce the square footage of the 2nd story (the project



Town of Yountville

Staff Report

exceeds FAR & requests a deviation from FAR under the MDP). The application also requested a deviation from the MDP for setback on Humboldt Street. The Code requires 15' and the building as designed is 10' from the property line bringing the mass and bulk closer to the street. Additionally, although the general plan envisioned the parking to be concealed/screened the board may want to review the design of the port-coche're and determine if the design of this element adds to the massing along the Humboldt frontage. The additional use of massing techniques that might mitigate heavy or bulky forms (such as modulating building mass, partial upper stories, setbacks, for upper stories volume, or a variety of roof forms may want to be considered. Additionally building placement/design that is compatible with adjacent structures to ensure that new buildings do not overwhelm their sites, or their neighborhoods may also want to be considered.

It should be noted that all the required findings/standards for each of the requested applications all work together. One of the findings required for design review (and incorporated by reference to approve the MDP) is that the project complies with Title 17 and is consistent with the General Plan. So, conflicting Title 17 standards would need to be waived through design review or granted as a deviation with the MDP. The Town is not required to grant those deviations or waivers. Unlike projects subject to ministerial approval, the Town can deny this project and impose conditions as it sees fit.

Staff requests that the ZDRB provide direction to staff and the applicant on the design of the project so that the necessary findings can be made.

RECOMMENDATION

Receive staff report and direct questions to staff.

Receive the Applicant's presentation.

Conduct public hearing and receive public comments.

Conduct ZDRB discussion on Project application, provide feedback and direction on the Project proposal to staff and the applicant.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Project Plans
- B. Project Narrative
- C. Traffic Impact Assessment, prepared by AMS Associates, dated April 5, 2024.
- D. Stormwater Control Plan, prepared by AMS Associates, dated January 25, 2024.
- E. Hydrology/Hydraulic Study, dated January 25, 2024.
- F. "Draft" Public Works, Utility, and Earthwork and Grading Conditions of Approval
- G. "Draft" Fire department conditions of approval.
- H. Comment letters from neighbors