



## Staff Report

Item #: 8B

---

## Zoning and Design Review Board Staff Report

**DATE:** February 13, 2024  
**TO:** Board Members  
**FROM:** Kyle Johnson, Assistant Planner  
**Applicant:** Jim Towle  
**Owner:** Jack Morris  
**Location:** 2 Heritage Court (036-453-001)  
**Land Use Classification:** MPR Master Planned Residential

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Approve with conditions the Design Review permit for Single Family Dwelling Remodel at 2 Heritage Court.

### **PROJECT SITE**

The site is currently developed with a single-family residence with a front porch, and an attached 2 car garage. This property is a 9,583 square foot lot located in the Heritage subdivision. The floor area of the property is currently 2,874 square feet and the floor area ratio is 0.299.

### **DISCUSSION/BACKGROUND**

In April of 2023, a Stop Work Order was issued for the subject property for work being done without the benefit of a building permit. In response to the Stop Work Order, the applicant submitted a project proposal in June of 2023. The application for a remodel was deemed incomplete and the applicant resubmitted in November 2023. Additional work was proposed for some minor additions (as discussed in the staff report) and the project included the addition of a Junior Accessory Dwelling Unit (JADU) and Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). In December of 2023, the Town issued a Zoning Clearance Letter approving the JADU and ADU. Although the project plans include information describing the ADU & JADU additions, these elements are subject to ministerial approval under State law and are not in the purview of the Board; these are provided for informational purposes only. The Board's review is limited to the discretionary items discussed in this report.

The project proposal includes modifications to west elevation of the building, interior demolition and remodel, and expansion of the residence in three areas totaling 135 square feet. The expansions include enclosing a 54 square foot section on the west elevation, a 51 square foot section on the south elevation, and a 30 square foot reduction in the garage to add a half bathroom to the residence. Modifications to the west elevation include removal of the chimney, adjustments to the roof hip designs, and additions of a sliding glass door and windows for access to a proposed 487 square foot, concrete patio. Proposed interior remodel includes mitigation of the scope of work subject to the above mentioned Stop Work Order. The scope of interior remodel includes demolition and remodel of the kitchen, bathrooms, bedrooms, and family room. All proposed design material are to match existing material and colors. The proposal will not modify existing setbacks. The

proposed expansions will move exterior walls, which are currently recessed, to be flush with existing outer walls.

The existing floor area of the property includes the 2,341 square foot home and 533 square foot garage for a floor area ratio (FAR) of 0.299. With the proposed additions, and excluding the 493 square foot JADU and 963 ADU, the 2172 square foot home and 508 square foot garage provide for an FAR 0.28. This exceeds the maximum FAR of 0.25, however this is less than the existing FAR and may be approved because the legal non-conformity is not made worse by the proposed changes.

The proposed design is consistent with the design of the existing structures on site and meets all applicable requirements detailed in the findings below. In accordance with YMC 17.188 this project requires Minor Design Review approval by the Zoning and Design Review Board.

## **Findings**

### **YMC 17.188.060 Design Review Findings**

Per YMC 17.188.060, the reviewing authority may approve the application and authorize a design review permit if the facts presented establish all the following.

A. The proposed development or physical improvement is appropriate for the site with regard to the siting and scale of buildings, pedestrian and vehicular access and circulation, and relationship of structures and open spaces to the streetscape;

*The proposed modifications are appropriate for the site. Pedestrian and vehicular access and circulation are unchanged from what currently exists. The expansion on the west elevation changes the relationship between the single-family dwelling and the streetscape. The expansion adds a sliding glass door and outdoor patio to the west elevation. Minimal privacy is provided by the existing 6 foot fence and trees along the west elevation.*

B. The location of structures preserves significant trees, natural features and identified public view corridors;

*The proposed project will not impact public view corridors. There are two existing trees proposed to be removed in the location of the proposed patio. These trees both have a DBH less than ten inches and are determined not to be protected trees. The property also contains protected trees with roots which may be impacted by the proposed project. The project shall include a Tree Protection Plan with the building permit submittal to be reviewed and approved by the Town Arborist. The protected trees include an 18 inch Elm and a 15 inch Carob tree.*

C. The project will be compatible with neighboring properties and developments with regard to setbacks, building heights, and massing;

*The project meets minimum setback and height requirements and massing.*

D. The project will not be detrimental to neighboring properties and developments with regard to the location of parking facilities, siting of trash enclosures, placement of mechanical equipment, and privacy considerations.

*The project does not propose changes that will impact neighboring properties with regard to parking facilities, trash enclosures, mechanical equipment or privacy considerations. Parking conditions, trash enclosures, and mechanical equipment locations are unchanged.*

E. The project presents an attractive design, utilizing high-quality building finishes and materials, and design techniques to mitigate potentially bulky building forms, such as modulating varied rooflines, partial upper stories, setbacks for upper story volume and/or a variety of roof forms.

*The project presents modulating rooflines and varying setbacks to mitigate appearance of massing and proposes attractive designs to match existing conditions.*

F. Proposed landscaping provides sufficient visual relief, complements the buildings and structures on the site, and provides an inviting environment for the enjoyment of occupants and the public.

*The project does not propose landscaping changes.*

G. The existing or proposed infrastructure and utility capacity are adequate for the proposed development.

*The project does not propose changes which will impact the infrastructure or utility capacity.*

H. The proposed project will comply with all applicable provisions of Title 17 and will be consistent with the policies and standards of the General Plan.

*The proposed project is determined to be compliant with applicable provisions of Title 17 and policies and standards of the General Plan as described in the attached Staff Report.*

### **YMC Chapter 17.40 Residential Design Standards and Guidelines**

The following design standards and guidelines apply to new or altered residential structures and auxiliary structures. They are intended to guide project design and the design review process and inform applicants about Yountville's unique built environment. These design standards and guidelines supplement the development standards in the Zoning Ordinance and further the goals and policies of the General Plan which encourage high quality design.

If a qualifying residential project does not meet one or more of the design standards, the Town's existing discretionary design review process may allow alternative design approaches deemed appropriate by the reviewing authority.

The design guidelines are subjective criteria mandatory for residential projects not required to be reviewed only against objective standards under State law. Application of design guidelines may be waived through design review approval when deemed appropriate based on the unique conditions of the subject site and its surroundings.

<b>Single-Family and Duplex</b>	<b>Design Standard</b>	<b>Analysis</b>
<b>Garages, Driveways and Parking</b>		
X	The width of each garage door shall not exceed 12 feet when located in the front half of the lot and visible from the street.	Garage doors are not proposed to change.
X	Multi-car garages are permitted if located on the rear half of the lot or screened from view from adjacent street frontages by building placement, landscaping, and/or fencing in compliance with Chapter 17.136.	Existing multi-car garage will not be relocated. A small modification includes reducing the square footage by removing a portion of the garage and adding the square footage to the Single Family Dwelling.
X	Carports shall be located in the rear half of the lot or screened from view from adjacent street frontages by building placement, landscaping and/or fencing in compliance with Chapter 17.136.	No carport is proposed or existing.

X	For single-family houses with attached garages, the width of the house shall be at least five feet greater than the width of the garage along its street frontage. The garage shall be set back at least 10 feet farther than the house from the street.	The existing garage is 22'1" and the remaining home frontage is 32'4". The existing garage is 10' closer to the street than the house, however it is existing, and no change is proposed.
X	In the Old Town Historic District, driveway aprons shall be a solid surface, concrete, or pavers, for the width of the driveway and the length from the existing edge of asphalt street to the right-of-way line or five feet, whichever is greater.	NA -The property is zoned Master Planned Residential.
	Parking shall be located behind buildings or in the rear half of the lot.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
	Parking lots shall be screened along all street frontage with walls or evergreen landscaping at least three feet in height. Along common property lines and abutting residential uses, walls and landscape screen shall be provided as established in Chapter 17.136.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
	Lighting for parking areas shall be designed to confine emitted light to the parking areas and the light source shall not be visible from adjacent properties. Average illumination at the ground shall be no more than one foot candle, except where an increase in lighting level is recommended by a lighting consultant or qualified professional as necessary for safety.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
<b>Street Frontage</b>		
X	The principal orientation of all buildings shall be parallel to streets they face.	The principal orientation of the building is unchanged and remains parallel to the street.
	The street-facing elevation of multiple unit residential buildings shall have at least one street-oriented entrance and shall contain the principal windows of the street-facing unit(s).	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
X	Primary building entrances and associated paths of travel from the adjacent street(s) shall be visible from the adjacent street(s).	The primary building entrance is visible from the adjacent street.
X	Building facades that face street frontages shall include breaks in their wall plane by incorporating one or more techniques along at least 20% of the entire street-facing facade, such as varying setbacks, recessed or projecting building entries, wall offsets, wall projections or variation in materials.	The front building façade is unchanged and includes breaks in the wall plane by use of varying setbacks and a front porch. The west elevation is street fronting, and the expansion removes breaks in the wall plane. Additionally, the approved ADU provides wall breaks by use of varying setbacks to reduce massing.

X	A covered porch shall be incorporated into the front elevation for new construction. The minimum required porch shall be at least 72 square feet in area and shall measure at least six feet deep (measured perpendicular to the front wall of the house). Porches shall be unenclosed but may be screened.	The proposed project is for an addition/remodel of the existing residence and a front porch approximately 100 square feet exists at the front of the home.
	The street frontage of new buildings shall contain one of the following elements:	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
	- One-story or two-story unenclosed porches,	
	- Roofed balconies supported by brackets or by columns at the ground level, or	
	- Upper floor loggias recessed within the building.	
<b>Building Scale and Massing</b>		
X	Buildings shall carry the same design in terms of form and massing, roof design, wall and window design, and colors and materials on all building elevations.	All exterior walls of the building provide a consistent design in terms of form and massing and the proposed design materials match the existing building.
	Blank walls (facades without doors or windows) shall be less than 30 feet in length if visible from adjacent street(s).	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
<b>Roof Forms</b>		
X	The main roof of the building shall have a minimum pitch of 4 in 12 as shown in Figure 17.40-1.	The proposed roof pitch will match the existing 4:12 roof pitch.
X	Roofs which incorporate multiple ridges, eaves and/or dormers are required. Up to 20% of the area of a structure's roof may be flat.	Changes to the west elevation remove a roof hip, however the remainder of the proposed building incorporates multiple ridges and roof hips.
X	Roofing shall be composition shingle, standing seam, other fabricated metal, or tile from natural materials. Concrete tile, wood shake, or tar and gravel roofing is prohibited.	The proposed roof material is Composition Shingle.
<b>Windows, Doors and Entries</b>		
X	Only wood-frame windows, vinyl-clad wood windows or powder-coated metal-framed windows colored by the manufacturer are permitted. Bare metal, plastic, or silver-colored aluminum windows or screen frames are prohibited.	Proposed windows will match existing wood-framed windows.
X	Shutters, if incorporated, shall be the same size as half the adjacent window width.	No shutters are proposed.
	Multifamily developments shall include individual front doors and enclosed stairs for access to units above the ground floor.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
X	Trim surrounds shall be provided at all exterior window and door openings. In lieu of exterior window trim, windows can be recessed from wall plane by a minimum of three inches.	Proposed windows and doors include trim surrounds to match existing.

	Where adjacent to residential development, windows, balconies, and similar openings shall be oriented so as not to have a direct line-of-sight into adjacent units or onto private patios or backyards on abutting properties. This can be accomplished through window placement, stepbacks of upper stories, use of clerestory windows, glass block or opaque glass or mature landscaping within the rear or side setback areas.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
<b>Exterior Building Materials</b>		
X	The following exterior materials are allowed: wood (lap siding, board and batten, shingle), cement board, or stucco. Natural brick or stone is allowed as an accent material only, covering no more than 25% of any building facade. T-111 or plywood shall not be permitted.	The proposed siding is grey shingle wood siding to match existing. Brick is included on the existing front façade. This brick feature is natural stone color and is not proposed to change.
X	Design material changes shall occur at intersecting planes, at inside corners of changing wall planes or where architectural elements intersect such as a chimney, pilaster, or projection, except for the base of buildings, corner boards or gable ends.	Design material changes occur at intersecting planes on all exterior walls.
<b>Landscaping and Open Space</b>		
X	A minimum of one tree shall be planted within the front yard setback for new development. This standard does not apply to the MHP, Mobile Home District.	NA -The proposed project is not new development.
<b>Utilities and Auxiliary Structures</b>		
X	1. Utilities and refuse storage areas are not permitted in any setback area or front yard;	Refuse storage areas are in the existing garage. Additional refuse storage in the east side yard was approved for the ADU and JADU. These storage bins are setback behind a privacy fence approximately 6 feet.
	2. All new electrical, telephone, CATV and similar service wires or cables shall be installed underground. Risers on poles or buildings are permitted;	New electrical, telephone, CATV, and similar service wires are not proposed.
	3. Air conditioners and similar mechanical equipment shall be screened from view;	All mechanical equipment is screened from view in the east side yard.
	4. Electrical vaults and meter boxes shall be screened from view from any public right-of-way. Fire pipes and extinguishers must be easily identified; and	Electrical meter box is existing and screened from view in the east side yard.
	5. For multifamily uses, refuse storage areas shall be screened from public and adjacent properties view or located within a building.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
	Trash and recycling areas shall be fully enclosed structures with solid roofs and shall conform with all mandated water quality requirements and building codes, including Americans with Disabilities Act	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.

	accessibility.	
	Chain link fencing and gates with wood or plastic slats shall not be used for trash and other utility enclosures.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
X	All exterior mechanical and electrical equipment shall be screened by landscaping or fencing or incorporated into the design of buildings so as not to be visible from the street. Equipment to be screened includes, but is not limited to, all roof-mounted equipment, air conditioners, heaters, cable equipment, telephone entry boxes, irrigation control valves, electrical transformers, pull boxes, and all ducting for air conditioning, heating, and blower systems.	All exterior mechanical and electrical equipment is existing and screened from view in the east side yard.
X	Reduced pressure backflow prevention devices are required for connection to the Town's water system and are required to be above ground but shall be screened from adjacent public street(s) by landscaping or fencing while allowing access for annual testing.	The existing backflow device is in the east front yard and is screened from view.

<b>Single-Family and Duplex</b>	<b>Design Guideline</b>	<b>Analysis</b>
<b>Subdivisions</b>		
X	Lots should be predominately rectilinear in shape and orthogonal to the street. Odd-shaped parcels should be avoided.	NA - The existing lot is not proposed to change. The parcel is oddly shaped with a curved front setback.
X	Aggregation of lots is discouraged.	NA- No aggregation is proposed.
X	Varied roof heights and front setbacks are encouraged to give individuality to each structure, especially when there are two or more adjacent lots to be developed.	NA- The proposed project is not a subdivision. The subdivision the property is in includes varied roof heights.
<b>Driveways, Garages/Carports and Parking</b>		
X	Garages are encouraged to be located in the rear half of the lot.	The existing garage is in the front half of the lot and is not proposed to be relocated.
X	Detached garages and garage doors that do not face the street are encouraged.	The existing garage is attached and faces the street. No changes are proposed.
X	Single-car garages may be located near the front of the lot, though this is discouraged.	The existing garage is a two-car garage.
	The pattern of circulation, including access drives and pedestrian paths, should provide easy access from the parking lot to residential uses.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.

	Access drives to off-street parking shall be designed and constructed to provide adequate safety for pedestrians and drivers. In no case shall car movements result in blocking of the street right-of-way. The number of access drives shall be limited to the minimum that will accommodate anticipated traffic.	NA, this requirement applies to multi-family developments.
X	To minimize the amount of paved area, sharing of driveways and access to parking lots is encouraged. An easement providing for shared use shall be recorded.	No changes are proposed to the existing driveway.
X	On-site paving for vehicles should be of a permeable material, where practical.	No changes are proposed to the existing concrete driveway.
X	For shared driveways exceeding 100 feet in length, turnouts may be needed for vehicles to pass one another.	NA - The existing driveway is not shared.
<b>Roof Forms</b>		
X	Roofs should incorporate pre-plumbing and pre-wiring in new development for easy installation of solar water heating and photo-voltaic (PV) solar panels, where feasible. Solar panels should be incorporated into roof design and be low-profile, where possible.	The proposed project is not new development.
<b>Building Exterior Colors and Materials</b>		
X	Buildings shall have consistent materials, details, and architectural theme on all sides of the buildings. Materials that appear faux or veneer-like should be avoided. Joints or raw edges of materials shall be concealed to create an appearance of authenticity.	The building proposes consistent design materials, details, and theme on all sides. Materials are wood shingle siding, wood frame and trim, composition shingles, stucco, and natural stone. These materials are not veneer-like.
X	Auxiliary structures that require issuance of a building permit should have consistent exterior material(s) and color(s) with the primary building.	The proposed project does not include auxiliary structures.
X	Mediterranean and Tuscan design styles that include, but are not limited to, the following common characteristics of clay tile, heavy stucco, or plaster, cut and cast stone, wrought iron details, tower-like chimneys, heavy massing, arched openings, and arcades are prohibited.	NA - The proposed design is not Mediterranean or Tuscan style.
<b>Windows, Doors and Entries</b>		
X	Sliding glass doors are discouraged and the use of large picture windows should be limited when these features are visible from the street.	The project proposes a sliding glass door and large picture windows on the west elevation. This elevation is visible from the street; however it is screened by the existing 6 ft fence and existing trees.
X	Double-hung windows should maintain a 1.5:1 height to width ratio or greater.	No double hung windows are proposed.

X	Where adjacent to single-family development, windows, balconies, and similar openings should be oriented so as not to have a direct line-of-sight into homes or onto private backyards on abutting properties. This can be accomplished through window placement, setbacks of upper stories, use of clerestory windows, glass block or opaque glass, or mature landscaping within the rear or side setback areas.	Proposed changes do not include windows, balconies, or similar openings oriented as to have a direct line-of-sight into homes or onto private properties.
---	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

### **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

Approval of the design review application is not a project subject to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) (Public Resources Code section 21000, et. seq.) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines (California Code of Regulations, Title 14, section 15000, et seq.) section 15061(b)(3) (Common Sense Exemption). To the extent approval of the design review permit application is determined to be a project subject to CEQA, it is categorically exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15301 (Existing Facilities).

CEQA Guideline 15061(b)(3) (Common Sense Exemption): This subsection excludes activities from CEQA that do not have the potential to cause a significant effect on the environment. The design review permit application is not considered a project for CEQA purposes because it can be seen with certainty that the Single Family Dwelling remodel and addition of 135 square feet will not have a significant effect on the environment.

CEQA Guideline 15301 (Existing Facilities): This Class 1 categorical exemption applies to minor alterations of existing private structures involving negligible or no expansion of existing or former use. This exemption applies because the proposed remodel and expansion of the Single Family Dwelling involves negligible or no expansion of the existing use.

### **STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL**

Is item Identified in Strategic Plan? Yes

If yes, Identify Strategic Goal and Objective. **Quality of Life:** The Town enhances the livability of Yountville by providing well-maintained public facilities, parks, and trails, and quality programs and events.

Briefly Explain Relationship to Strategic Plan Goal and Objective. By participating in design review, the Town ensures new developments comply with Municipal Code requirements, helping maintain the Town's quality of life.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

Receive staff report and direct questions to staff.

Receive the Applicant's presentation.

Conduct public hearing and receive testimony.

Conduct ZDRB discussion on Design Review.

Motion and second to approve Design Review Permit with attached conditions.

### **Attachments**

Project Plans

Conditions of Approval