

From: [John Ferons](#)
To: [Hilary Gaede](#)
Cc: [Public Comment](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] REDWOOD TREE - 6750 JEFFERSON ST, YOUNTVILLE
Date: Monday, March 4, 2024 2:14:30 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[yountville redwood tree letter 2.2024.pdf](#)

John F
Town of Yountville
Public Works Director

From: Hering, Paul (MMA) [REDACTED]
Sent: Friday, March 1, 2024 5:11 PM
To: Brad Raulston <braulston@yville.com>; John Ferons <jferons@yville.com>; Hilary Gaede <hgaede@yville.com>
Cc: Public Comment <PublicComment@yville.com>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] REDWOOD TREE - 6750 JEFFERSON ST, YOUNTVILLE

This email was sent from a sender outside of your organization. Please be wary opening any attachments or following any links from this email. Please remember we will not send automated emails without warning or explanation.

Dear Mr. Raulston, Mr. Ferons & Ms. Gaede –

As I am unable to attend the Town Meeting next week on March 5th, I am writing in follow-up to our previous correspondence on this subject as well as the recent report prepared by Tony Wayne Wolcott Consulting, the Certified Arborist. My concerns are specifically related to the redwood tree located at 6750 Jefferson St. My wife Susan and I, along with our friends Jack & Donna Galloway, own the home across the street from this tree at 6757 Jefferson St. Attached to this email I have also included a copy of a letter we previously sent to Mr. Raulston.

First, I would like to thank you for your very open communication on this matter and also the speed and attention you have clearly committed to this issue. Your responsiveness has been refreshing and is much appreciated.

By way of a very brief introduction, I have been in the insurance / risk management industry for over 40 years. Currently, I am Vice Chairman of Marsh McLennan Agency, a subsidiary of Marsh, the largest insurance brokerage organization in the world. I simply share this to convey that I have some expertise in the areas of risk management, insurance and liability exposures.

The report by Wolcott is extensive and quite thorough. Allow me to focus on some specific items referenced in the report:

- Page 3: “...this Redwood comes with risk due to its size and various nearby targets.”
- Page 3: ...this tree presents a “low-risk rating for both failure types.” ***(I point this out to***

convey that it is not a NO RISK situation. The consultant confirms there is risk, albeit LOW in his opinion.)

- Page 3: “The one option that eliminates the Redwood’s risk is to remove the tree.”
- Page 3: “The Redwood’s location seems unfortunate with the asphalt road, gravel-covered walkways, and proximity to nearby houses.”
- Page 3: In the last paragraph, the consultant seems to be making the case that ideal Redwood growing conditions are “not always readily available in Napa County.” **(This seems to imply that this tree is not located in a normal optimal location for Redwoods to thrive.)**
- Page 5: This Redwood is “not on the Heritage Tree List.”
- Page 6: “A redwood this size drops a considerable amount of organic debris, including branches. Ideally, the tree would benefit from its natural mulch on the surface surrounding the tree. There is a slight lean toward the street.” **(Note that this tree CANNOT benefit from its natural mulch due to where it is located which is essentially on the street itself.)**
- Page 7: The consultant notes a “miniscule movement amount to 6/1000th of foot.” **(While miniscule, the key point here, in my view, is that there is movement. Who can say that there wouldn’t be more movement in another serious weather event.)**
- Page 9: “Although the Tree Risk for Redwood Tree is Low, removing the Jefferson Street Redwood Tree eliminates any tree risk.”

I apologize for the length of this email but simply want to be as complete as possible with my thoughts. I don’t think anyone would argue that this tree is a beautiful specimen. If there was no risk, then it would be an easy decision to preserve this tree. At this point, however, I believe that a number of residents in the area have expressed their concerns about the exposure and risks of both catastrophic property damage and severe bodily injury or even death presented by this “Town Tree.” Sadly, the reality we face is that we are experiencing more extreme weather events including in the Napa Valley, on a regular basis. This only serves to increase the risks presented by this tree.

In my opinion, allowing this risk to continue is simply not an acceptable option and creates a potentially serious liability for the Town of Yountville. As confirmed in the report, the one option that eliminates the risk is removing the tree.

Thank you again for your attention to this matter and for your ongoing communication.

Sincerely,

Paul

Paul Hering
Vice Chairman

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

This e-mail transmission and any attachments that accompany it may contain information that is privileged, confidential or otherwise exempt from disclosure under applicable law and is intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it was intended to be addressed. If you have received this e-mail by mistake, or you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, dissemination, distribution, copying or other use or retention of this communication or its substance is prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately reply to the author via e-mail that you received this message by mistake and also permanently delete the original and all copies of this e-mail and any attachments from your computer.

Please note that coverage cannot be bound or altered by sending an email. You must speak with or receive written confirmation from a licensed representative of our firm to put coverage in force or make changes to your existing program. Thank you.

This e-mail, including any attachments that accompany it, may contain information that is confidential or privileged. This e-mail is intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it was intended to be addressed. If you have received this e-mail and are not an intended recipient, any disclosure, distribution, copying or other use or retention of this email or information contained within it are prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately reply to the sender via e-mail and also permanently delete all copies of the original message together with any of its attachments from your computer or device.
